

APPENDIX A. All comments recieved by FWP on the proposed one-year grazing-lease extension at Spotted Dog WMA. Comments were received via email (E) and mail (M) no later than the posted deadline of 3 December 2012.

Com- menter #	Via ^a	Para- graph	Comment
1	E		I support the request by Rock Creek Cattle Co. to be allowed to graze on the subject property for an additional year.
2	E		Grazing is forage management. Proper management is absolutely necessary to maintain a healthy ecosystem, reduce fire potential, and to attract wildlife. If you stop grazing the Spotted Dog, you will slowly ruin this ecosystem. Don't listen to those that are undeducated in rangeland management. Grazing is a good thing when done properly. You have studies that show this.
3	E	a	This Program needs to stop.
		b	It's time to stop these Welfare Cowboys from feeding from the public trough.
4	E		FWP's proposed extension of the Spotted Dog grazing lease seems a calm and orderly step along the way to fulfilling its intended purposes for an array of Montana's wild species. I agree with key features of planning the WMAs contributions to the Spotted Dog's elk -- and that goes with them -- beyond this final year of the subject grazing agreement.
5	E	a	I'm strongly opposed to extending the grazing lease for 3 reasons:
		b	1. Foremost, It is contrary to the premise & proposal under which the NRD Program funded the acquisition.
		c	2. Rock Cr. Cattle Co. does not appear to be a particular friend of hunters -- i.e., sale of "gated community" lands, & no big game hunting by public on ranch property east of I-90.
		d	3. Grazing on WMA reduce winter forage left for wildlife. Leave the grass for wintering elk, not "corporate cows."
6	E	a	I have hunted and hiked on the Spotted Dog WMA for the past two years. Primarily in the Jake and Freezeout area, with a little time spent in the NW area accessable via microwave tower ridge. From the head of Jake Creek I have also walked into the head of Spotted Dog Creek while hunting.
		b	My first comment on this proposal is that these cattle must be moved off the rangeland prior to the beginning of general rifle season. The first weekend of 2012 general season was a mess with all the cattle still on the WMA while numerous hunters were pursuing big game. In our case, we would very likely have had a shot at a legal bull in the timber of Jake Creek, until spooked cattle ran right through the area in the timber where the elk were grazing. This was after we got within approximately 100 yards of the elk. The number of cattle have been less since the first weekend, but with cowboys and dogs frequenting the area moving the animals off it just raises hell with trying to hunt! Your total AUM's would not have to change in order to accomplish this and therefore the revenue would not be dimimished. Just end the grazing period on October 15 instead of November 15 and have a greater number of AU's occupy the land for a shorter period of time and still reach your AUM goal.
		c	I also believe the long term health and benefit to wildlife can be accomplished if the cattle are a continual part of the management plan on this WMA. There are numerous areas underutilized by cattle with the grasses being rank and less palatable to both domestic stock and elk. If cattle are to remain as part of the WMA plan you should employ a knowledgeable range specialist to take measures that will utilize the old grasses while restricting the cattle from the riparian areas. The riparian areas by the way are in poor shape from all the abuse over the years. I would like to see money collected from grazing fees put to use protecting these riparian areas. FWP is not an agency known for rangeland specialists, you are a wildlife agency. Do not just go with rest rotation as a range plan. Talk with experts in the field and create a dynamic management plan that uses the cattle component to the betterment of all concerned. Thank you,
7	E		I would like to state that I do not wish or want Rock Creek Cattle Company to be able to allow their cattle to graze on Spotted Dog WMA beyond the current year. Being a hunter the cattle and the moving of the cattle disrupts the hunting of Elk and deer, especially during the general rifle season.
8	E		Spotted Dog opened to the public for hunting my first year of hunting. The few years that I have been out there i do know that the cattle effects the first three weeks of the hunting season. The first year the cattle was removed with in the first week the ranch opened. The second year cattle was left to graze until the second week into hunting. This year the cattle was still out grazing as of last weekend. This will be the third week into hunting. Not only do we have to watch out, drive around, and hike where the cattle are, we have to make sure that they are not in line of fire if we do see a deer or elk. To me the cattle is impacting the recreation use of the property that is there. I have seen old roads that are maked not for motorzied use, used by the owners of the cattle. I am still not sure why they do not have to follow the rules that we do. I will be a relief to see the cattle leave and let the wildlife return to the ranch and surrounding area.

Com- menter #	Via ^a	Para- graph	Comment
9	E		This sale is final in Dec 2012 and I don't think that rock creek cattle co. needs public assistance to keep it afloat. If we let the grasses grow without cattle grazing for a few years the Elk will return to grazing and winter range use.
10	E	a	As I read the EA, you folks have gotten into a pickle. You need more time to fence out the likely trespass grazers and to complete a land exchange with the Forest Service. I wish you well on both of those endeavors. However I'd like to tell you a story to indicate where I'm coming from. I hope you terminate livestock grazing as soon as possible
		b	In 2011 we visited Spotted Dog and camped with our horses for almost a week. It is a great place to ride. However, by the time we had gotten to a place that was suitable to pull off the road and park, our wheel wells were plastered with fresh cow manure - the road was paved with it! We stayed 5 nights. During the night and when we were away riding, the Angus would come up and snot up the side of our rig and rub on anything that would give them an itch so at night when they did this we'd have to get out of bed and go run them off. Nice outing, eh? Then the rutting Angus bulls would come through camp and act like they were supreme. We generally tried to keep them away from our camp but they were persistent. However, one of these guys took a particular liking to my black mare and became quite belligerent when I tried to run him off. I thought I would have to shoot him during one of his charges but he veered off. If you keep grazing during the Angus breeding season you should advise folks to carry a gun or bear spray! When we got home it took over \$5.00 at the car wash to get all the cow manure out of our wheel wells.
		c	We drove over this year to see if anything had changed and if it would be suitable for a camping trip. To our disappointment it was not suitable for camping and when we got home it was back to the car wash to clean out our wheel wells.
		d	Based on my view of the huge areas of stomped down streams and springs and the massive areas of lupine, season long grazing is not what Spotted Dog needs now after decades of that treatment. I would request that you finish the fencing as soon as possible and give the grasslands some rest. It is one of the few public areas that has so much area of high elevation grasslands - a scarce commodity these days!
11	E	a	I am submitting a comment regarding the question of grazing on the Spotted Dog Wildlife Management Area. The question as reported in the Independent Record November 5th is highly ambiguous. The headline uses the phrase, "grazing right." The first sentence of the article uses "privilege to graze cattle." Of course, the Spotted Dog WMA was partly RCCC property and part State land. Whether or not RCCC had a grazing permit on the State Lands was not disclosed in the article. Presumably, some future grazing agreement was part of the sale contract.
		b	If, as stated in the Independent Record, "as part of the purchase agreement, RCCC retained a right to graze cattle through Dec. 31, 2012," then that agreement should be honored by both parties to the agreement.
		c	The arcane and very unclear article also mentions "the one year proposed grazing extension" and "terminating grazing on the property for at least one year."
		d	The spotted Dog WMA has seen heavy livestock grazing, first sheep, then cattle for perhaps a century and a half. Now some of the drier upland areas have decent range conditions. Areas with water show their history of heavy use by domestic livestock.
		e	There is no place for cattle or sheep on land set aside to be used for wildlife management. The economics of cattle grazing on public land have been studied at the University of Montana as your range management people know. Why should the wishes of one entity, namely RCCC, take precedence over the interests of the public? RCCC is now primarily a land development company rather than a cattle company anyhow. They sold the land; it is ours, not theirs, now.
		f	I say no cattle on the Spotted Dog Wildlife Management Area.
		g	Please acknowledge receipt of this note.
12	E		I understand that Rock Creek Cattle wants to extend its' right to graze the Spotted Dog past December 31. I would be against this proposal. It seems that unless continued grazing was part of the sale, it should not be allowed. Rock Creek was compensated for their loss of grazing as part of the purchase price so the extension does not seem warranted.
13	E	a	These are my public comments in reference to the above. Please make sure Mack [Long] gets this as I'm not sure I have his correct e-mail address. Thank you.
		b	I have addressed the FWP Commission twice concerning this grazing. Also, I have had detailed conversations with Ray Vinkey and viewed in field this WMA. I believe we all can agree this WMA needs for the plants to be rested from domestic livestock grazing, and the riparian areas need to heal. Mack and I have talked in detail that in a practical world without completion of the ongoing and planned FWP fencing projects on this WMA, livestock control is almost impossible. So grazing in 2013 may be reasonable.
		c	As I said at the last Commission meeting, I believe a win-win situation can take place in 2013. My recommendations are as follows:

Com- menter #	Via ^a	Para- graph	Comment
		d	1. Specify the on date of June 1, 2013 at the earliest. This will give the plants a chance to grow before cattle grazing.
		e	2. Specify the off date of Oct. 1, 2013 at the latest. This will address the hunter frustration of having the WMA covered with cattle during hunting season. Also, there can be some fall growth allowing the plants to go into winter in better condition. This off date is compatible with the three USFS adjacent grazing allotments (Off 9/15, 9/30, 10/10). Also, all of these allotments are cow/calf allotments. Usually, the calves are weaned around October.
		f	I have spoken with the USFS Range Manager and retired Range Manager that are familiar with these allotments and grazing on the WMA. They didn't see any problem with these on-off dates affecting the USFS allotments.
		g	3. The DNRC lands that are leased by the FWP can have these on-off dates also. It is my understanding that FWP has the authority to do this on these leased DNRC lands.
		h	4. I support the potential boundary adjustments with the USFS as we know this process may take years.
		i	5. The total number of head permitted to RCCC on the WMA should not exceed the 2012 level and be as low as can be agreed on.
		j	After having detailed conversations concerning this grazing proposal, I've asked Chris Marchion from the Anaconda Sportsman Club and Tim Aldrich, President of the Montana Wildlife Federation to contact you also.
		k	Finally, ONE YEAR IS ONE YEAR IS ONE YEAR!! I think we all are looking forward for the Spotted Dog WMA to have a long overdue rest and healing. I certainly support considering domestic cattle grazing on this WMA some time in the future under a scientific grazing management plan. However, the number one goal is forage for wildlife.
		l	Future discussions concerning road management and motorized vehicle use that displace the wildlife off this MWA to private land is a major concern for me. Ray and I have discussed and I'm sure that he and Mike [Thompson] will address this in the future.
14	E	a	On behalf of the Montana Wildlife Federation, I offer support of the proposed One-Year Extension of the Spotted Dog Grazing Lease with the following qualifications:
		b	1. We cannot support the way the "on" and "off" dates have been described. We recommend that this be changed to specify that the On Date shall not be before June 1, 2013 and the Off Date shall not be later than October 1, 2013. We have found that these dates are close to on and off dates on other Federal Public lands in the area. We also believe that this will share the use of this WMA with archery hunters in a much more equitable way.
		c	2. The extension should not be a precedent for future extensions of this Lease, this is a one-year only extension. This property is to be managed as a WMA and future uses of this area for commercial grazing should only be allowed under an approved Grazing Allotment Management Plan that puts wildlife needs and associated benefits first and foremost.
		d	We thank you for the opportunity to review this EA for the proposed project and offer our comments.
15	E		I realize that cattle grazing within the Spotted Dog WMA is a significant source of income for the FWP but I would like to see the practice discontinued to improve the habitat quality as well as the user experience in the area. I have fished Spotted Dog Creek several times and the condition of the riparian area around the stream is very poor. I am not a biologist but all appearances are that this has been caused by grazing cattle. I have also attempted to ride my mountain bike in the area several times and have had a very poor experience each time due solely to the cattle present. The cattle seem to like to run along in front of a person on a mountain bike leaving the trail in a most unpleasant condition. I think with a number of road closures and dramatically reduced numbers of cattle, the Spotted Dog WMA could be a great place to hike, bike, fish and hunt.
16	E		Howdy, I am a hunter who has been enjoying the Jake Creek/Freezeout creek area for the last two years. I greatly appreciate this hunting opportunity, it is beautiful walking and scenery. I also caught a few small trout in spotted dog creek this past summer and can see what a great fisheries resource this land represents. It seems that the Jake Creek area was somewhat overgrazed and the riparian area damaged by cattle, so I am glad that the grazing will stop for a year. My vote is to not bring cattle back to this WMA, or with reduced numbers and stream protection.
17a	E		I AM OPPOSED TO THE EXTENSION OF GRAZING ON THE SPOTTED DOG WMA. WMA should be for wildlife not livestock.
17b	E	1	No extension of grazing on Spotted Dog.

Com- menter #	Via ^a	Para- graph	Comment
		2	There should be NO grazing on WMAs. Wildlife areas should be for wildlife not livestock. Any Forest Service or DNRC grazing areas within a WMA should be fenced by the FS or DNRC not FWP. I also object to the idea that grazing can be used as a "management tool" on WMAs, I do not believe there is any science that would support this.
		3	Get cattle off and keep them off!
18	E	a	These comments are submitted on behalf of the Anaconda Sportsmen's Club. We collaborated with Rod Bullis on the analysis of this proposal and endorse the comments submitted by Rod. We would prefer no domestic grazing on this property until the native vegetation has recovered and an appropriate long term management plan has been developed and vetted through a public process. However we embrace the process that allows for a transition for the historical private grazing interests and if FWP determines that a good neighbor action is appropriate we would support a one year grazing extension based on the criteria Mr Bullis has proposed. Further extensions would not be appropriate. We expect that future grazing decisions will be a product of the long term management strategy for this property.
		b	In the spirit of this good neighbor action we would request FWP to engage the lessee about a reciprocal action on public access on their extensive holding in this area. Currently there is no public access allowed on tens of thousands of acres they own. The lack of hunting opportunity has created a large population of elk which creates damage on neighboring private lands. This is an opportune time to discuss public access and appropriate wildlife management with this landowner.
19	E	a	Yes, I believe grazing of cattle should be continued on the Spotted Dog WMA for two reasons.
		b	1. Grazing enhances elk habitat. Elk don't eat old grasses, but prefer short grasses such as those left after grazing cattle.
		c	This was proven in the documentary "Landscape" produced by Montana Fish, Wildlife and Parks in cooperation with the USDA Forest Service, Bureau of Land Management, Montana Stockgrowers Association, Montana Woolgrowers Association, Montana Wildlife Federation, Montana Association of Grazing Districts, Montana Public Lands Council and Rocky Mountain Elk Foundation. The video was distributed by the Rocky Mountain Elk Foundation.
		d	2. Because DNRC owns lands inside the boundaries of Spotted Dog WMA the funds received from grazing will continue to benefit schools, and will also provide funds to FWP for management of the WMA.
		e	I oppose the proposal for a land exchange with USFS because that will have an adverse impact on local ranchers who have grazing permits.
20	M	a	Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the Draft Environmental Assessment (EA) for a Montana Fish, Wildlife & Parks (FWP) proposal to extend livestock grazing on the Spotted Dog Wildlife Management Area (WMA) through 2013.
		b	As a Conservation District, we are supportive of maintaining agricultural uses in the Deer Lodge Valley. It is our feeling that some level of livestock grazing should continue in the future on Spotted Dog WMA. We realize that to achieve necessary restoration and to meet your goals and objectives for the management of the WMA that future livestock grazing may not be at current of historic animal unit months (AUM's).
		c	The Deer Lodge Valley Conservation District believes that under proper management, a long-term sustainable level of livestock grazing can be accommodated within the WMA. Montana FWP has demonstrated that this is a viable option in other areas, such as Fleecer. A long-term grazing management plan would generate a consistent level of revenue that could be applied directly to improvement of the Spotted Dog WMA.