

Montana Department of Fish, Wildlife & Parks (FWP)  
**Developing Recommendations - Managing Recreation on the Madison River**  
**Madison River Citizen Advisory Committee (MCAC) – Meeting #Two**  
June 13, 2012

**Session Summary**

**PROCESS OBJECTIVES**

**Within the Advisory Committee's Charter, develop consensus recommendations around the following 4 tasks:**

1. Review and assess river recreation information and existing conditions on the Madison River.
2. Identify and describe desirable or acceptable recreation conditions for the Madison River.
3. Identify and describe conditions that would warrant implementation of various management actions.
4. Develop a list of those management actions (less restrictive to more restrictive).

**SESSION OBJECTIVES**

- Affirm the Committee's governance structure including the Charter.
- Move forward on the collaborative process.
- Set the calendar.

**MCAC MEMBERS PRESENT**

- Robin Cunningham (PO Box 34, Gallatin Gateway, Montana 59730; 406-763-4761; [rcunningham@montana.net](mailto:rcunningham@montana.net))
- Joe Dilschneider (PO Box 1406, Ennis, Montana 59729; 406-581-5150; [joe@montanatrout.com](mailto:joe@montanatrout.com))
- Joe Fontaine (170 Elk Meadows Ranch Road, Cameron =, Motnaa 59720; 406-682-5702; [joefontaine@3rivers.net](mailto:joefontaine@3rivers.net))
- Bob Gibson (311 Fieldstone Drive, Bozeman, Montana 59715; 406-587-4327; [bobgib3@bresnan.net](mailto:bobgib3@bresnan.net))
- John Juracek; [jjuracek@gmail.com](mailto:jjuracek@gmail.com)
- Lee McKenna (PO Box 86, Helena, Montana 59624; 406-570-1589; [leemckenna2525@yahoo.com](mailto:leemckenna2525@yahoo.com))
- Philip Naro (21 Crescent Point, Bozeman, Montana 59715; 406-595-6663; [p.naro@wispwest.net](mailto:p.naro@wispwest.net))
- John Way (PO Box 625, Ennis, Montana 59729; 406-370-5206; [john@montanaway.com](mailto:john@montanaway.com))
- Virginia Tribe – Facilitator: [vtribe@bresnan.net](mailto:vtribe@bresnan.net)

**AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES AT THE MCAC TABLE**

Pat Flowers (FWP)

Chris McGrath (BLM)

## **COMPLETED AGENDA ITEMS**

### **Review/Affirmation of the Committee Governance Structure**

The MCAC affirmed the governance structure they established at the May convening meeting. (The complete structure is located at the end of this document.)

### **Making Sure We're on the Same Page with the Collaborative Process**

**The MCAC will be using the "interest-based" collaborative process explained in their notebooks and is basically outlined in the following steps:**

- Identify and come to mutual understanding of "interests".
- Recognize/clarify the questions that need to be addressed in the process and clarify interests around each question.
- Affirm the "issue statement" represented in the Charter.
- Review and connect the guiding principles to the Committee's tasks.
- Discuss the concept of "fair standards"/objective criteria.
- Develop options for "mutual gain".
- Work together toward agreement based on interests, guiding principles, and a search for fair standards.
- Come to agreement and develop final recommendation language.

### **Sampling of "Trapline" Comments**

**The following represent a sample of the comments MCAC members received in conversation with their "traplines":**

- Some asked why only 7 meetings were planned and felt that the process might need more time.
- There were questions about how the public would be involved with the Committee.
- Some indicated opposition to boats in angler wading areas.
- Issues on the lower Madison – the dam from "bikini" bridge – were identified as particularly important to some.
- People wondered what the Committee figured out in the first meeting.
- There is some cynicism about the process.
- Several stated that they are worried about impacts on businesses tied to recreational use of the River due to potential management actions.
- Business owners in the Ennis area explained that they basically survive on the "80 days of fishing use on the River.
- Some want things kept the way it is now.
- There is worry/fear among "fishing businesses" and other businesses about possible changes.
- Some are concerned about the effects of angling on wildlife watching.

## Identifying/Exploring “Interests”

### **Individual MCAC members listed and explained the following “interests” as a starting point in the collaborative process:**

- It is in my interest to conserve the biodiversity of the Madison River and the riparian corridor because it is the basis for economic and recreational opportunities for future generations.
- It is in my interest to help influence the retention of the River’s original character to the greatest extent possible because those that follow us should be afforded the same opportunities that I had to feel and see the beauty, naturalness and solitude that I experienced.
- It is in my interest to maintain a healthy resource in the Madison drainage because no money or fun can be had on a degraded or polluted river.
- It is in my interest to preserve the beauty of the River and quality of the recreation experience.
- It is in my interest to be a good steward of the Madison River (that is, protecting the resource), while still maintaining and accommodating a full spectrum of recreational activities.
- It is in my interest to be a “Shepherd” for the future generation of river guides and ensure the next generation can have the same access and opportunity I was given.
- It is in my interest to share my perception of a quality experience because perception will be the gauge for acceptable recreational use levels and conditions.
- It is in my interest that the Madison River continues to provide world-class fly fishing and floating experience and enjoyment for all. By doing so, we will care for the River to ensure that it remains healthy and safe to fish and float for generations to come.
- It is in my interest to preserve wade fishing only areas from Hebgen Dam to Lyon’s Bridge.
- It is in my interest to monitor and reduce fishing pressure because of concerns about overfishing during peak use times.
- It is in my interest to retain commercial use at current levels and availability because it directly impacts both my business as an outfitter and fly shop owner as well as the vitality of the community where I live.
- It is in my interest to maintain reasonable opportunities for commercial fishing guiding/outfitting on the Madison because that is often the sole source of income for many local and regional out-of-area FOAM outfitter members.
- It is in my interest to set measurable standards for recreational use impacts on water quality and fish populations because these resources are essential to commercial fishing guiding/outfitting activity.
- It is in my interest to recognize the business and economic concerns of the communities that rely heavily on Madison River recreation.

### **Identifying/Exploring “Interests” cont.**

- It is in my interest not to restrict but encourage nonresident use of the Madison because the economy in the town where I live and do business depends on it.
- It is in my interest to address the issues that relate to commercial fishing use and the use of the River in general by the floating/angling/wildlife viewing public.
- It is in my interest to devise an effective strategy to deter littering on the Madison River, particularly the stretch between Warm Springs Fishing Access Site and Black’s Ford Fishing Access Site.
- It is in my interest to employ current and sufficient data because quality data can educate and inform perception.
- It is in my interest to develop and adopt effective, efficient management techniques and processes because I want to avoid burdensome, costly regulations that may result in increased record-keeping and permit fees.
- It is in my interest to educate the public to be conscious of how their actions may impact others and to respect others’ right to enjoy the River.
- It is in my interest to retain transparency and integrity in the MCAC and River Planning process because many in the local communities believe FWP has a preconceived agenda and predetermined result from this Committee.
- It is in my interest to better understand the needs, desires and knowledge of the other River users because it increases all of our chances to find consensus that benefits the River.
- It is in my interest to familiarize myself with management options that guide/determine FWP and BLM positions on issues because I have to accept them due to State and Federal law and administrative rules.
- It is in the interest of managing Agencies to promote public safety; protect and preserve the resource for the use and enjoyment of present and future users; minimize/manage user conflicts; provide for a variety of quality recreational and educational opportunities; develop and maintain appropriate recreation facilities that balance public demand, protection of resources, and fiscal responsibility.

### **Establishing Discussion Context**

#### **Working in small groups, MCAC members began discussion related to the tasks assigned to the Committee. The results of those conversations are found below:**

1. Review and assess river recreation information and existing conditions on the Madison River.
  - Task one has to do with educating the Committee so it was not assigned to a small group. The Committee will request and explore information and data including existing conditions as they move through the process.

2. Identify and describe desirable or acceptable recreation conditions for the Madison River.

The small group suggested that the Committee begin by exploring the following important questions:

- What are people valuing in their experience on the River?
- How do people rank the factors that contribute to their valuing the River?
- If you choose to not recreate on the Madison River, why?
- Why do you choose the Madison River for your recreation?

3. Identify and describe conditions that would warrant implementation of various management actions.

- Pollution that is degrading the quality of the River
- Natural events with negative impacts such as disease; earthquakes; drought; fire; invasive species (e.g., zebra mussels, lampreys, etc.)
- Man-made disasters such as hazardous material spills, dam breach
- Conditions that may exist or might exist in the future – that would warrant an action as determined in this process
- Public safety related to traffic, alcohol, drugs, litter, etc.

4. Develop a list of those management actions (less restrictive to more restrictive).

The small group suggested that the Committee begin by exploring the following important questions:

- What would be considered least restrictive?
- What would be considered most restrictive?
- What management actions would start to impact commercial users?
- What management actions would affect non-commercial users the most?
- What approach to zoned use would be most/least acceptable to non-commercial and/or commercial users... to resident and/or non-resident users?
- What would be the most restrictive management actions that would affect recreational opportunities?
- What management actions would be least/most acceptable to commercial and/or non-commercial users... to resident and/or non-resident users?
- What seasonal use restrictions would be acceptable to commercial and/or non-commercial users?
- What seasonal use restrictions would be acceptable to resident and/or non-resident users?

Desired Data:

- *Management actions that have worked in other locations and management actions that have failed and why*
- *Information on real and perceived changes in quality of recreation experience that followed implementation of specific management actions*

## **Where do we go from here?**

### **“Bullet Points” from this Meeting**

- An 8<sup>th</sup> member representing the West Yellowstone community was added to the Committee through coordination with the Governor's Office.
- Committee members identified their individual interests and the Committee explored, discussed, and tried to understand them.
- The Committee began to think about their specific tasks as laid out in their Charter.
- The Committee reviewed and discussed data presented/distributed by FWP.

### **Setting the Calendar**

The Committee will meet:

- August 2 – 4:00 to 8:30 PM in Ennis (location to be announced).
- August 21- 4:00 to 8:30 PM in Ennis
- September 26, 27 – all day sessions – Bozeman, Montana

### **Homework**

- Review the Guiding Principles found in the Planning Manual (page 23).
- Continue conversation with your traplines – with a focus on Committee Task #2 – Describing “desired condition” on/for the Madison River.
- Review assigned data:
  - Summary of Findings from the Madison River On-Site Survey, Summer 2009; Research Summary
  - Madison River – 2008 Survey of Property Owners; Fact Sheet
  - 2008 Survey of Montana Resident Anglers Concerning the Madison River; Summary of Research
  - Give or send the facilitator your “interests”.

**Madison River Citizen Advisory Committee (MCAC) Governance**  
**MCAC members established the following governance structure to encourage productive discussion and a functional process toward their recommendations:**

Roles within the Process

- Facilitator:
  - Plan, manage, and provide a summary of MCAC meetings
  - Design/facilitate a collaborative process
  - Be the process keeper.
- Individual MCAC members:
  - Bring interests to the table and work to develop mutual understanding of interests
  - Seek useful data; fairly represent the facts
  - Honor the process and its governance structure
  - Communicate with your constituents; run your trapline
- Committee of the whole:
  - Work collaboratively to achieve the hopes and expectations of the Charter
  - Hear public comments
  - Work hard to and use the process to reach consensus
  - Recognize the role of the Committee in River Recreation planning and the process that follows the Committee's recommendations
- Involved Agencies:
  - Describe Agency interests
  - Maintain familiarity with and participate in Committee discussion
  - Where needed, explain managing Agency Administrative rules
  - Offer comments related to what it feasible
  - Remain objective and honor the collaborative process
  - Facilitate presentation of recommendations to the Commission
- Technical Support:
  - Describe the current situation related to the Madison River
  - Help clarify issues by providing the best data possible
  - Respond to reasonable data requests from the Committee
  - Be present at meetings to answer questions
- The Public:
  - Honor the Committee governance structure
  - Witness the process
  - Serve as part of "traplines" if asked
  - Comment related to Madison River management

### Discussion Ground Rules

- Be civil. Demonstrate respect for each other and the public in our communication and our behaviors.
- Recognize the validity of each other's interests and opinions.
- Raise hand to help manage the discussion – to comment... to ask questions. When necessary, the facilitator will manage the “hands”.
- When speaking, try to be clear and concise.
- Allow the person speaking to finish – don't interrupt. Listen actively and honorably – before preparing to respond. (People are often so focused on what they are going to say in response, they miss part of the speaker's comments.)
- Avoid labeling or personal attacks.
- Avoid side conversations.
- Stay on point and remain positive. No profanity!
- Strive for consensus recommendations among the 7 citizen members. Recognize that there may be an issue/a time when it is necessary for the Committee to decide to use a “majority” rule approach because consensus is not possible. Those not in agreement can write a minority report for that issue. When interim or final agreement is reached, through either a consensus or majority approach, members won't sabotage the process away from the table.
- While a FWP and a BLM representative will be seated at the MCAC table, the 7 citizen members are recognized as those needing to come to agreement. At the same time, Committee members will seek the input of the Agency representative in order to understand Agency interests and determine the reasonableness of a particular proposed recommendation.
- Turn off electronic devices unless using your computer to access data, etc.

### Process Agreements

- Be on time for each meeting – regardless of location.
- Notify Pat Flowers if you can't attend a meeting.
- At the end of each meeting, agree on 3 or 4 consistent bullet points/“talking points” related to the process and their progress. Use those points in discussion outside of MCAC meetings. If it appears useful, agree on a “point person” for that meeting.
- Post the meeting summaries and MCAC logistics on the Department's website.

### Logistics

- Have 3 meetings in Bozeman; 3 in Ennis; and 1 in West Yellowstone.
- Strive for fairly frequent meetings – 3:00ish to 8:30ish PM.
- Try to find 1 or 2 times when the Committee could meet for a full day.