

Project: **Varney Bridge, 8 M S Ennis, STPB 249-1(10)8**
UPN: **9038000**
Date: **4/7/2017**

Single vs Two Span Selection Summary

Public Comment Summary

Format	Date	Name	Comment Summary
Verbal - Meeting	5/13/2016	Jeff Laszlo	No preference on bridge type
Verbal - Meeting	2/13/2017	Nani Luebke & Dave Cope	Support of two span
Written - Public Meeting	2/22/2017	Madison Valley Rural Fire District	Support of a bridge capable of supporting emergency vehicle.
Verbal - Public Meeting	2/22/2017	Not Identified	Supportive of both single and two span option - Just happy it's a trus.
Verbal - Public Meeting	2/22/2017	Not Identified	Prefers single span
Verbal - Public Meeting	2/22/2017	Larry & Ann Leonard	Supportive of both single and two span option. Wants more info for further consideration.
Verbal - Public Meeting	2/22/2017	Not Identified	Supportive of both single and two span options - no preference.
Written	2/27/2017	Larry & Ann Leonard	Support of two span
MDT "Contact Us" System	3/7/2017	Valerie Thornburg	Support of two span
Written	3/13/2017	Nicholas & Sharilyn Thomson	Support of two span

Resource Agency Comment Summary

Format	Date	Name	Comment Summary
Written	2/24/2014	Army Corps of Engineers	Length should accommodate entire width of Madison River channel. Still awaiting further written comments.
Verbal - Meeting	6/9/2016	MT FWP - Fisheries: Travis Horton, Dave Moser, Andrew Puls, Cheryl Morris	Recommends Single Span. See meeting minutes for other comments.
Written	9/29/16, 4/6/17	MT FWP - SPA 124 Program Manager: Jonathan Ferree	Recommends Single Span

Gov't Agency Comment Summary

Format	Date	Name	Comment Summary
Verbal - Meeting	3/27/2017	MDT - Bridge: Nathan Haddick, Kent Barnes	Recommends Single Span
Verbal - Meeting	3/27/2017	MDT - Environmental: Deb Wambach	Recommends Single Span
Verbal - Meeting	3/27/2017	MDT - District: Jeff Ebert	Recommends Single Span
Verbal - Meeting	3/27/2017	Madison County - Commission: Jim Hart	Recommends Single Span

Engineer's Bridge Type, Size, & Location - Report Summary

Evaluation Criteria	Single Span	Two Span
Construction Cost (bridge only)	\$3,850,000	\$4,140,000
Cost Effectiveness	+1	0
Construction Duration	+1	0
Construction Ease/Technical Feasibility	+1	0
Environmental Impact/Resource Agency Preference	+1	0
Minimize Ice gorging Impacts	+1	0
Positive sign indicates an advantage over the other option		

3/24/17 Meeting to Discuss public input and make a final determination of the single span or two span bridge design option

Attendees: Jeff Ebert – MDT Butte District, Kelly Williams – MDT Consultant Design, Nathan Haddick – MDT Bridge, Kent Barnes – MDT Bridge, Jim Hart – Madison County Commission, Karl Yakawich – Great West Engineering

Summary of Discussion

The advantages of the single-span steel through truss include cost effectiveness, reduced construction duration, and minimized in-stream work due to the lack of a center pier. This results in reduced impact to the river; thus, allowing for natural stream function. The clear span system is also less susceptible to ice gorging damage; a known issue of the Madison River.

The advantages of the two-span steel through truss includes matching the existing aesthetics of the current truss bridge configuration.

Public input included preferences for both the single span and two span options. Comments from the 2/22/17 public meeting (12 members of public in attendance) indicated no strong preference for either option. Written comments received favored the two-span alternative to mimic the existing bridge aesthetics.

Based on upon all considerations the single-span alternative was unanimously agreed to be the most responsible choice.



Sign-in Sheet

Project name: VARNEY BRIDGE 8 M S ENNIS
 Project ID: STPB 9015(126) • Control Number: UPN 9038000
 Meeting Date: Wednesday, Feb. 22, 2017
 Meeting Time: 6:00 p.m.; presentation 6:00 p.m.
 Location: Ennis Elementary School cafeteria, 323 S. Charles St., Ennis, Mont.

Please print!

	Name	Mailing Address (include physical address and email address)	Phone Number (MDT right-of-way use only)
1.	James E. Beltz	P.O. Box 667 Ennis 38 Tobacco Road Dr. Ennis, MT 59729 tbelz@uss65e.net.com	682-7809
2.	Greg TSAIRIS	Box 737 York Harbor ME 03911	207- 752-3440
3.	Bernie Ogletta	P.O. 1609 Ennis	
4.	Caitlin Amy Madison	P.O. Box 365 Ennis	682-7755
5.	Jason Petrillo (3 Rivers)	Box 1098 ENNIS	590-7001
6.	Blair Richards	200 Shining Mt Loop	835-2956
7.	Rich Gockel	10 Fox Trail Ennis; MT 59729	682-7285
8.	Kathleen Cipe	11 V Timber N Ennis MT 59729	682-3503
9.	Jim HART	P.O. Box 278, Virginia City, MT 59745 madco@madison.mt.gov	843-4277
10.			

Please print!



Sign-in Sheet

Project name: VARNEY BRIDGE 8 M S ENNIS
 Project ID: STPB 9015(126) • Control Number: UPN 9038000
 Meeting Date: Wednesday, Feb. 22, 2017
 Meeting Time: 6:00 p.m.; presentation 6:00 p.m.
 Location: Ennis Elementary School cafeteria, 323 S. Charles St., Ennis, Mont.

Please print!

	Name	Mailing Address (include physical address <i>and</i> email address)	Phone Number (MDT right-of-way use only)
71.	Jan Nessel	907 N. Rouse Ave Bozeman, MT 59717 <i>jan.nessel@yahoo.com</i>	406-566-4707
72.	STP RENATE BETZ	P.O. Box 667 ENNIS, MT 59729	(906) 682-7809
73.	Suz Richards	206 Shining Mtns Loop Rd Ennis MT 59729	406 219 3482
74.	Jen Nelson		494-7630
75.	Kelly Williams	MDT	444-7964
76.	ANN & CARRY LEONARD	aleonard13@ MT aol.com	(909) 645-0434
77.			
78.			
79.			
80.			

Please print!